



What works in brief interventions?

Early intervention for common mental health conditions in young people



This quick reference table summarises the current state of scientific evidence for brief (2-8 sessions) skills-based psychological interventions for early intervention, with a focus on what is helpful for anxiety and depression in young people (12-25 years old). This table is intended to complement the 'Brief psychological interventions for young people with common mental health disorders' evidence summary. The evidence summary provides more in-depth detail and recommendations to inform practice.

This table can help inform clinic-based psychological intervention for early intervention with young people showing symptoms of anxiety and depression. Where studies were less relevant or applicable to this context, we have noted this in the quality rating and used the term 'extrapolated'. Results for these less applicable studies were given less weight in our evidence rating.

Evidence strength key for each brief intervention



★★ Multiple good quality studies support this approach.

There are a number of studies supporting this approach; however, evidence type and/or study quality may be inconsistent.

*

There are at least two studies showing this approach works; however, evidence type and/or study quality may be inconsistent.

There is insufficient evidence to say whether this approach works.

What works in brief interventions?

Intervention type	Helpful for early signs of	Effect size (where significant and reported)	Evidence strength	Results
Behavioural activation	Depression (including subthreshold)	Medium to large	*	Moderate to strong effect sizes from 2x randomised controlled trials. ^{1,2} Significant difference without effect size on 2x extrapolated randomised controlled trials. ^{3,4} Inconsistent results (positive self-report results, null clinical results) from 1x extrapolated randomised controlled trial. ⁵
Physical activity	Depression	N/A	?	1x poor quality randomised controlled trial with no effect size reported and inadequate analyses. ⁶ Insufficient evidence to report evidence strength.
	Anxiety	Large	**	Large effect size from 3x randomised controlled trials. ⁷⁻⁹



Intervention type	Helpful for early signs of	Effect size (where significant and reported)	Evidence strength	Results
Problem-solving	Depression	Large	?	Large effect from 1x randomised controlled trial. ¹⁰ Null results from 1x randomised controlled trial. ¹¹ Significantly better outcome from 1x extrapolated randomised controlled trial without effect size. ¹²
	Anxiety	N/A	?	Null results from 1x randomised controlled trial. ¹¹ Significantly better outcome from 1x extrapolated randomised controlled trial without effect size. ¹² Insufficient evidence to report evidence strength.
Sleep	Depression	Small to large	**	Large effect size from meta- analysis of large randomised controlled trials. ¹³ Small effect size from 1x randomised controlled trial. ¹⁴ Null results from 1x randomised controlled trial. ¹⁵
	Anxiety	Small	**	Small effect size from meta- analysis of large randomised controlled trials. ¹³ Small effect size from 1x randomised controlled trial. ¹⁵
Mindfulness	Depression	Medium to large	*	Medium to large effect sizes from 3x randomised controlled trials. ^{1,16,17} Significantly better outcome from 1x extrapolated randomised controlled trial without effect size. ¹⁸ Null results on 1x extrapolated quasi- randomised controlled study. ¹⁹
	Anxiety	Medium to large	*	Medium to large effect sizes from 3x randomised controlled trials. ^{16,17,20} Insufficient findings from 1x extremely small cohort study with case analysis. ²¹ Null results from 1x extrapolated randomised controlled trial. ¹⁸

Intervention type	Helpful for early signs of	Effect size (where significant and reported)	Evidence strength	Results
Relaxation therapy	Depression	Medium	*	Medium effect sizes from 1x randomised controlled trial. ²² Significant improvements without effect sizes from 2x extrapolated randomised controlled trials. ^{23,24}
	Anxiety	N/A	?	Significant mean difference without effect size reported in 2x extrapolated randomised controlled trials. ^{24,25}

References

- McIndoo CC, File AA, Preddy T, Clark CG, Hopko DR. Mindfulness-based therapy and behavioral activation: A randomized controlled trial with depressed college students. Behav Res Ther. 2016 Feb;77:118-28.
- Takagaki K, Okamoto Y, Jinnin R, Mori A, Nishiyama Y, Yamamura T, et al. Behavioral activation for late adolescents with subthreshold depression: a randomized controlled trial. Eur Child Adolesc Psychiatry. 2016 Nov;25(11):1171-1182.
- Taylor FG, Marshall WL. Experimental analysis of a cognitive-behavioral therapy for depression. Cognitive Therapy and Research. 1977 03/01/ Number 1/March 1977;1(1):59-72.
- Turner RW, Ward MF, Turner DJ. Behavioral treatment for depression: An evaluation of therapeutic components. Journal of Clinical Psychology. 1979;35(1):166-175.
- Shaw BF. Comparison of cognitive therapy and behavior therapy in the treatment of depression. Journal of Consulting and Clinical Psychology. 1977;45(4):543-551.
- Sadeghi K, Ahmadi SM, Ahmadi SM, Rezaei M, Miri J, Abdi A, et al. A Comparative Study of the Efficacy of Cognitive Group Therapy and Aerobic Exercise in the Treatment of Depression among the Students. Glob J Health Sci. 2016 Oct 1;8(10):54171.
- Broman-Fulks JB, ME.; Rabian, BA.; Webster, MJ. Effects of aerobic exercise on anxiety sensitivity. Behaviour Research & Therapy. 2004 2//;42(2):125-136.
- Broman-Fulks JJS, K. M. Evaluation of a brief aerobic exercise intervention for high anxiety sensitivity. Anxiety, Stress & Coping. 2008;21(2):117-128.
- Smits JAJB, A. C.; Rosenfield, D.; Powers, M. B.; Behar, E.; Otto, M. W. Reducing anxiety sensitivity with exercise. Depression & Anxiety. 2008;25(8):689-699.
- Eskin M, Ertekin K, Demir H. Efficacy of a Problem-Solving Therapy for Depression and Suicide Potential in Adolescents and Young Adults. Cognitive Therapy and Research. 2007;32(2):227-245.

- Hoek WS, J.; Koot, H. M.; Cuijpers, P. Effects of internet-based guided self-help problem-solving therapy for adolescents with depression and anxiety: A randomized controlled trial. PLoS ONE. 2012;7(8).
- Biggam FH, Power KG. A controlled, problemsolving, group-based intervention with vulnerable incarcerated young offenders. Int J Offender Ther Comp Criminol. 2002 Dec;46(6):678-98.
- Blake MJ, Sheeber LB, Youssef GJ, Raniti MB, Allen NB. Systematic Review and Metaanalysis of Adolescent Cognitive--Behavioral Sleep Interventions. Clinical Child and Family Psychology Review [Report]. 2017;20(3):227-250.
- Dewald-Kaufmann JFO, F. J.; Meijer, A. M. The effects of sleep extension and sleep hygiene advice on sleep and depressive symptoms in adolescents: a randomized controlled trial. Journal of Child Psychology & Psychiatry & Allied Disciplines. 2014;55(3):273-283.
- Blake MW, J. M.; Schwartz, O.; Raniti, M.; Simmons, J. G.; Blake, L.; Murray, G.; Dahl, R. E.; Bootzin, R.; Dudgeon, P.; Trinder, J.; Allen, N. B. The SENSE Study: Post Intervention Effects of a Randomized Controlled Trial of a Cognitive-Behavioral and Mindfulness-Based Group Sleep Improvement Intervention among At-Risk Adolescents. Journal of Consulting and Clinical Psychology. 2016 01 Dec;84(12):1039-1051.
- Biegel GM, Brown KW, Shapiro SL, Schubert CM. Mindfulness-based stress reduction for the treatment of adolescent psychiatric outpatients: A randomized clinical trial. J Consult Clin Psychol. 2009 Oct;77(5):855-66.
- Tan L, Martin G. Taming the adolescent mind: a randomised controlled trial examining clinical efficacy of an adolescent mindfulness-based group programme. Child and Adolescent Mental Health. 2015;20(1):49-55.
- Liehr PD, N. A pilot study examining the effect of mindfulness on depression and anxiety for minority children. Archives of Psychiatric Nursing. 2010;24(1):69-71.

- Walsh EE-M, T.; Baer, R. Brief Mindfulness Training Reduces Salivary IL-6 and TNF-α in Young Women With Depressive Symptomatology. Journal of Consulting & Clinical Psychology. 2016.
- Piet J, Hougaard E, Hecksher MS, Rosenberg NK. A randomized pilot study of mindfulness-based cognitive therapy and group cognitive-behavioral therapy for young adults with social phobia. Scand J Psychol. 2010 Oct;51(5):403-10.
- Salaman KS, Hainsworth KR, Ladwig RJ, Davies WH, Weisman SJ. A randomized, controlled pilot study of mindfulness-based stress reduction for pediatric chronic pain. Alternative Therapies in Health and Medicine. 2013;19:8-14.
- Vazquez FLT, A.; Blanco, V.; Diaz, O.; Otero, P.; Hermida, E. Comparison of relaxation training with a cognitive-behavioural intervention for indicated prevention of depression in university students: A randomized controlled trial. Journal of Psychiatric Research. 2012;46(11):1456-1463.
- Kahn JS, Kehle TJ. Comparison of cognitivebehavioral, relaxation, and self-modeling interventions for depression. School Psychology Review [Article]. 1990;19(2):196-211.
- Reynolds WMC, K. I. A comparison of cognitivebehavioral therapy and relaxation training for the treatment of depression in adolescents. Journal of Consulting & Clinical Psychology. 1986 Oct;54(5):653-60.
- Torabizadeh CB, S.; Yektatalab, S. Comparison between the effects of muscle relaxation and support groups on the anxiety of nursing students: A randomized controlled trial. Complementary Therapies in Clinical Practice [Randomized Controlled Trial]. 2016 Nov;25:106-113.

Resource writers Rebekah Anderson Affrica McCarthy

Disclaimer

This information is provided for general educational and information purposes only. It is current as at the date of publication and is intended to be relevant for all Australian states and territories (unless stated otherwise) and may not be applicable in other jurisdictions. Any diagnosis and/or treatment decisions in respect of an individual patient should be made based on your professional investigations and opinions in the context of the clinical circumstances of the patient. To the extent permitted by law, Orygen, The National Centre of Excellence in Youth Mental Health will not be liable for any loss or damage arising from your use of or reliance on this information. You rely on your own professional skill and judgement in conducting your own health care practice. Orygen, The National Centre of Excellence in Youth Mental Health does not endorse or recommend any products, treatments or services referred to in this information.



The National Centre of Excellence in Youth Mental Health Orygen, The National Centre of Excellence in Youth Mental Health is the world's leading research and knowledge translation organisation focusing on mental ill-health in young people.

For more details about Orygen visit orygen.org.au

Copyright © 2018 Orygen, The National Centre of Excellence in Youth Mental Health.

This work is copyrighted. Apart from any use permitted under the Copyright Act 1968, no part may be reproduced without prior written permission from Orygen.

Orygen, The National Centre of Excellence in Youth Mental Health 1300 679 436 info@orygen.org.au

orygen.org.au